

Criminal intelligence approach in the fight against terrorism



Agus Demirovski, MSc

PhD Candidate at Faculty of Security – Skopje
University “St. Clement of Ohrid” – Bitola
demirovski@gmx.com

David Berat, MSc

PhD Candidate at Faculty for Philosophy
University “Ss. Cyril and Methodius” - Skopje
beratdavid@hotmail.com

Abstract

The explanation of the main subject of this paper will first begin with an overview and analysis of the conceptual and terminological determination of intelligence and criminal intelligence as its subspecies, with their elements, specificities, characteristics and methods that are used in the fight against terrorism.

Intelligence methods as the main weapon of intelligence activity are necessary and all officers should apply them in their work in order to achieve successful results, and thus increase the effectiveness and efficiency of the service responsible for detecting and combating the risks and threats to national security.

The most important issues and dilemmas raised in the conduct of the anti and counter-terrorist fight will be set, explained, clarified and analysed within this paper in order to contribute to the creation of a more effective criminal-intelligence approach in dealing with terrorism. To this aim, the paper will use qualitative, general-scientific and logical methods to provide a security analysis of this theoretical-practical problem in the sphere of criminal-intelligence activity.

Keywords: Intelligence, Criminal Intelligence, Approach, Terrorism, Fight, Process, Cycle

Introduction

Collecting and processing data and information about the intentions of the other countries is, in fact, a process of providing appropriate information base indispensable for making decisions about actions and finding alternative solutions to counter any possible dangers. With the emergence and development of intelligence activities, intelligence methods as basic means and procedures for obtaining knowledge of the opponent's secrets have also been developed. The efforts providing the necessary information base for making decisions that protect the interests of the country from external dangers, in fact, represent the intelligence work, that is the use of intelligence methods to achieve the set aim.

The criminal-intelligence process integrates relevant information in a logical order, analyzes them and makes a conclusion, an assessment or crime prevention. Criminal Intelligence in the police aims at preventing crime, planning and deploying resources.

Crime prevention is accomplished by developing criminal intelligence products from information related to criminal activities of perpetrators. Such criminal intelligence products are used by the police to prevent commission of crimes by detecting and apprehending their perpetrators and applying strategies to eliminate or reduce crime threats. They are categorized as operational intelligence, which is used as a basis for making decisions on taking direct operational measures, primarily directed at individual entities, persons / groups and their activities.

Resource planning and deployment, on the other hand, are accomplished through the development of criminal intelligence products for the needs of decision makers that provide information on the characteristics and methodologies of criminal threats in order to develop response strategies and deployment of resources. These products are categorized as strategic intelligence, which on the basis of crime assessment enable the police to develop resource deployment plans depending on the threats of crime. Nowadays the fight against terrorism is imperative in the whole international community. The greatest burden in countering terrorism lies with the intelligence process. The quest for information on the composition, organization, location, capabilities, plans, motives and ambitions of terrorist groups is a huge challenge for intelligence agencies.

The fight against terrorism is highly dependent on human intelligence, the use of agents who need to look for information in the so-called covert operations. To be effective, counterterrorist intelligence must apply network properties and merge effectively with network operating forces. The fight against terrorism requires close cooperation of security services that are responsible for law enforcement as well as intelligence agencies.

Criminal intelligence: concept, purpose, function and role

Generally speaking, intelligence can be said to be a specific function of the state, that is, its security services, which needs to gather truthful and timely information on all possible dangers in order to be able to successfully conduct foreign and domestic policy. When defining the term intelligence, if we take the literal translation of the English word intelligence used to denote reporting, that is, reporting particularly important news, one would conclude that intelligence means providing data, information and news about some important eventsⁱ. Intelligence, thus understood, is a process of providing data and information about events in other countries that may affect the countryⁱⁱ.

The word intelligence can be used to describe the process of interpreting information in order to make them meaningful. Intelligence can also be described as processed information used for the purpose of carrying out actions. Intelligence always involves a degree of interpretation of data, resulting in an inevitable degree of speculation and risk. Intelligence includes statements of facts and findings that are the result of using logic in relation to relevant facts. Intelligence is not an expression of opinions or the application of traditional ways of looking at things. It must be information that improve the performance of services to achieve their goalsⁱⁱⁱ.

Intelligence is also used in criminal operations, as an important segment of security affairs and therefore stands out as a separate entity.

Intelligence is an organized activity of a social group, movement, party, and is part of the state apparatus (the state), aimed at gathering secret data and information from a potential or current adversary of military, political, economic, and cultural nature, in order to realize their own vital interests^{iv}.

Intelligence^v refers to the state's awareness and understanding of its strategic environment gained through the collection and analysis of secret and available information. Additionally, intelligence can also signify organizations that produce such knowledge; activities performed by those organizations; the organizational processes that direct these activities; and the product resulting from these activities.

Intelligence refers to the state's awareness and understanding of its strategic environment gained through the collection and analysis of secret and available information^{vi}.

By delineating the subject of research, the essence and form of the methods and the means that intelligence uses in the work, the following is defined : intelligence is organized

collection of confidential information and data about other countries through the agency of covert and illicit means and methods, intended for political purposes of the state that organizes such activity for the sake of safeguarding the security of its own country and damaging the interests, policies and security of other States^{vii}.

By means of intelligence, that is, by applying intelligence methods, the state assists and facilitates the achievement of its foreign policy goals, as well as timely access to information that enable it to successfully counter threats that may come from other countries.

Criminal intelligence is dealing with related and unrelated credible facts, which put in a process of analysis and thus analyzed products can reveal the planning, preparation, perpetrators, performance, method of operation and profit of any kind of illegal activity. They can also be used to detect, predict, prohibit, destabilize, and control crime activities, so that criminal intelligence itself can influence crime and assist in prosecution of crimes in any area^{viii}. In order to better understand intelligence work, it is necessary to explain the model itself which is basically a method of policing that enables with less assets and human resources to achieve greater and more effective results by establishing proportionality between the needs (strategic assessments) and the resources (tactical assessment) used to detect perpetrators of crime - the criminal network (subject-target profile) and emerging forms of crime (problem profile), all going through an intelligence process that is basically a proactive investigation. Complementary and parallel to this process is the criminal operational analysis that through its primarily analytical products (strategic assessment, tactical assessment and operational assessment), as well as techniques (risk analysis, association charts, flow of funds, etc.) would enable strategic decisions to be made on the basis of reliable data^{ix}. It should be noted that the concept of projective investigations is applicable to the research process as well - investigations through the use of analytical products and techniques by trained analysts in the units of analytical archiving process within the sectors of internal affairs.

The general mission of criminal intelligence is to gather knowledge that refers to individuals or groups involved in criminal conspiracies in order to understand how they function, to describe their current activities, and to anticipate activities that they might undertake in the future. Criminal intelligence should support managers of law enforcement organizations in the decision-making process. In crime prevention activities, managers must know the full picture of criminal groups and criminal activities within their jurisdiction, their number, strength, impact, occupation, as well as possible future activities.

The function of criminal intelligence when properly implemented (properly planned and effectively implemented) is one of the most important means of the police for detecting and

tackling (serious and organized) crime. By applying this function to the investigative process, the police are at a proactive advantage in detecting criminal activity, rather than reacting after a crime has been committed. Criminal intelligence can be put into effect in many actions taken by the police in detecting, prevention and throwing light on crime in all its forms. The needs of intelligence determine the type and scope of requirements associated with planning, prioritizing and taking necessary actions. This process must focus on gathering information in accordance with the law, gathering information that will be used to prevent crime or to deprive perpetrators of liberty, it must never be used for political purposes. The whole intelligence process consists of numerous phases-directions of collecting, sorting, evaluating, analyzing and distributing. Intelligence is a process that enables planning and direction while gathering information as a result of the strategic needs of the service, providing timely information with well-defined degree of reliability (assessment), as well as ensuring high protection of the sources of information through constant control of the process of creation and their use. This concept is the same at national, regional and local level with the exception of the scope, and perhaps more or less sophisticated depending on the quantity and nature of the professional equipment and software available.

Intelligence and antiterrorist struggle: Factors and Conditions

The evolution of terrorism reflects its complexity, dynamism and intensity, as well as its enormous threat to the national security of states and to overall international security. Today international relations are characterized by the emergence of new, more dangerous forms of terrorism with a potential to cause massive consequences, thus slowly making the world a hostage^x.

Performing a terrorist act has a primary and secondary effect. The primary action is to attack a particular object, person, or institution, and according to their plans, it usually happens with minimal incidental casualties. The secondary effect as a rule is the one whose importance for every terrorist organization exceeds the primary one multiple times, and that secondary effect is the public. For this effect, attractive targets are often chosen, with no major consequences for innocent victims. By announcing the news to the public, releasing a communique or taking responsibility for the event the main effect is achieved and publicity gained, whereas the people have the effect of fear, insecurity, mistrust in the authorities, et cetera, thus achieving the basic element of terrorism.

Once the attack occurs and the incident takes place, the support staff involved in the incident come to a safe zone and regroup. Leadership, command, and action personnel analyze the entire operation, detecting errors and drawing conclusions. These conclusions will be used in future attacks^{xi}.

After the global terrorist attacks, a number of flaws and irregularities were identified in the previous work of the intelligence services thus the need for some reforms in the intelligence sphere and work was imposed. The division of the intelligence services and their management by different centers which have not established a satisfactory level of cooperation, even within a single state, makes it difficult to exchange information, which are key elements in the anti-terrorist fight. Defense against terrorist threats, dangers and vulnerabilities requires authorities to replace the formal, hierarchical intelligence structure with horizontal, cooperative, and fluid architecture that receives information intended for those in need through the development of specific information communities of information sources^{xii}. Instead of focusing on central control, intelligence officials need to spend more time setting priorities, coordinating communication, providing technical assistance and ensuring data quality. Gathering more information from multiple sources will require greater analytical ability to prevent overload.

When defining the new structure for collecting, analyzing, and disseminating national security information^{xiii}, questions about how to improve security while maintaining openness and protecting personal privacy, cannot be avoided. Vigorous public debates are essential to answering these questions. Clear guidelines, formulated in the debate process, can provide public confidence in new policies. Information technology can provide tools to minimize these conflicts, foster collaboration and give reassurance that the right information should come to the right people at the right time. Procedures that provide accountability and oversight can ensure that lessons learned from previous experiences reinforce the state's information strategies to combat terrorism.

In fact, it is necessary to establish a system of joint control and management of the intelligence and counterintelligence services, in order to enable faster and more effective exchange of information, joint actions and unified leadership, command and management. Intelligence is an activity that through its elements should provide accurate and timely information about terrorists, terrorist organizations and their planned activities. The intelligence and counterintelligence services are the only competent and authorized authorities to apply covert methods and means to detect the preparatory actions that precede acts endangering the security of states. In fact, intelligence thus becomes a preventive function in the fight against terrorism.

Whether and to what extent the intelligence process will be effective in carrying out its preventive function in the fight against terrorism depends on: the ability to continuously operate and have a solid understanding of terrorist groups and individuals, their plans and goals, their political, economic and psychological motivation, leadership and guidance habits, membership, logistical and financial opportunities (for their covert accounts), links to other domestic and international terrorist organizations, links to countries sponsoring terrorism, and the structures of international organized crime that often act as their sponsors^{xiv}.

First of all, through intelligence, it is necessary to reveal the identities of those who participate in a certain terrorist plan. Of course, the content, that is, the purpose of that plan must also be found out. As a reminder, the primary task of intelligence is to prevent, or to put it another way, to be a step ahead of the terrorists and their plans, so that terrorist activities remain on paper, without being realized at all^{xv}.

The importance of intelligence for the successful conduct of the fight against terrorism is enormous. Intelligence is a key link in counterterrorism operations and investigations, in other words, successful intelligence is the most important weapon in the fight against terrorism. The ability of the state to detect, analyze, and act upon a terrorist threat largely depends on the efficiency of the intelligence apparatus.

The daily gathering of information on the identities, goals, plans and weaknesses of terrorists and terrorist organizations is the most difficult area in the field of intelligence. However, no other method of counterterrorism policy is more important in preventing, countering and responding to terrorist attacks. Intelligence in the sphere of counterterrorism is a special discipline with its own particular issues, specificities and much greater risks^{xvi}.

Criminal Intelligence and Tackling Terrorism: Challenges for the Republic of North Macedonia

Policies and programs aimed at building contacts and trust with local communities, including businesses, religious communities, youth and education leaders, as well as cultural centers can help and respond to violent extremism and terrorism. Hence, some countries, including the Republic of North Macedonia, are redefining community policing in the context of intelligence-led policing for anti-terrorist purposes, establishing structures and processes in the national legal framework for obtaining and analyzing information from the public and locally.

Objectively speaking, the Republic of North Macedonia is continuously exposed to asymmetric threats arising from the frequent manifestation of ethnic intolerance, religious intolerance and extremism, which in turn create a suitable ground for radicalization that may lead to terrorism. The actualization of the phenomenon of "foreign fighters", that is the internationalization of extremist-radical concepts, as well as the influx of migrants and refugees from the countries of the Middle East and North Africa have contributed to the growing threats of terrorism, which unfortunately have already happened in many cases.

With all this in mind, the key challenge is detecting, that is early alerting, and identifying possible threats of terrorism. To that end, the Republic of North Macedonia is continuously upgrading the normative and institutional capacities of the national security system, adopting a common security strategy, and developing and applying effective and functional mechanisms to deal with existing threats and risks. An example is the prevention strategy as a system of normative, security and broader - sociological measures to combat these security phenomena, managing the consequences of radicalization and reducing the risks of terrorism.. This strategy is based on the need to identify the causes, conditions and factors that produce extremism, but also to identify their interaction; then, defining the emerging forms and developing tendencies of extremist and terrorist activity, especially after the emergence of new forms of terrorism and the change of terrorist tactics.

In the context of the norms in this field, the National Security and Defense Concept of the Republic of Macedonia ^{xviii} is first to be mentioned, according to which the state institutions and bodies responsible for combating terrorism take their measures and activities on the basis of positive legislation and above all, The Constitution of the Republic of Macedonia as the highest legal act that guarantees the realization and protection of the fundamental freedoms and rights of the individual and citizen.

In addition, in a series of legislative and other relevant acts such as the National Strategy for Prevention of Money Laundering and Financing of Terrorism and the National Strategy for Defense of the Republic of Macedonia, the National Counter Terrorism Strategy (2015-2020) is the starting point for institutional action. This National Strategy on Combating Terrorism has been drawn up without a ready Action Plan for its implementation, and it is a good basis for taking repressive measures in the fight against terrorism. However, we are all aware that effective counterterrorism and all its forms and shapes may only be achieved by taking preventive measures and action. Therefore, a National Strategy for Combating Terrorism (2018-2022) ^{xviii} and a National Strategy for Prevention of Violent Extremism (2018-2022) ^{xix} were later adopted, a National Committee for Prevention of Violent Extremism and Fight

against Terrorism was established, and a National Coordinator for prevention of violent extremism and fight against terrorism was appointed, as well as two deputy national coordinators, one for the fight against terrorism and one for the prevention of violent extremism. The Committee is composed of 22 members and 22 deputy members who are permanently employed in 21 Ministries and institutions of the Republic of Macedonia. All members of the National Committee, experts dedicated to prevention of violent extremism and fight against terrorism, as well as civil society representatives who participated in public consultations organized in Skopje and Tetovo were involved in the preparation of the National Strategic Documents. The need to prepare new National Strategic Documents is due to the need to transfer activities for prevention of violent extremism and radicalization in the field of prevention, and to apply a comprehensive social and institutional approach in dealing with these security phenomena.

In the last few years, starting in 2015, the Macedonian police have begun to develop an intelligence-led policing model for central and regional police services that will provide recommendations for legal reform and reorganization of police structures through more efficient and effective inter-agency cooperation in the area of information exchange, which help fight terrorism, as well as violent extremism and radicalism that lead to terrorism.

Societal changes have imposed the need for necessary changes in law enforcement, in response to the more sophisticated methods of carrying out terrorist attacks and the efforts of terrorists to avoid confronting the law. The answer to modern forms of terrorism, as well as organized crime, is introducing a methodology in policing that will provide some insight into planned terrorist activities and thus put police action a step ahead of terrorists.

Based on an interview with three Ministry of Interior^{xx} advisers in line with the Ministry's plan, the implementation of this approach is carried out in three components, namely the preparation of an analysis of the current state of implementation of the intelligence-led policing model, the establishment of a legal framework for the concept of intelligence-led policing and developing a model for training and conducting intelligence-led policing training.

An assessment of the existing organizational structure at local and regional level has been made so far so that it can be upgraded and restructured through the introduction of European standards in policing. Strengthening of the cooperation between institutions that enforce law and exchange information in the Republic of North Macedonia was made, and the legal framework was reviewed and evaluated in order to improve and harmonize it with the European one, by drafting recommendations and bylaws.

All this work is done by the Department of Criminal Intelligence and Analysis at the Public Security Bureau and the regional organizational units for criminal intelligence analysis^{xxi}, which are responsible for collecting, processing and analyzing data and information according to previously established methodologies and standards for processing, it prepares analytical products and reports and disseminates them to the organizational units in the organizational units of the Public Security Bureau.

The main purpose of such activities is to contribute to the improvement of perception and capability of community police services, as well as improving police efficiency in gathering information to guarantee internal security and protection against contemporary forms of crime, including terrorist activities, moreover respect of civil rights and freedoms.

In the following period, the Ministry of Interior is focusing on application of new methods for resolving problems that affect communities, with a focus on preventing the factors that influence the emergence of extremism and the process of radicalization, with the main element being a balance between security and freedom.

In the country there is a Law on National Criminal Intelligence Database valid from 01.01.2012, which regulates the establishment and functioning of the National Criminal Intelligence Database^{xxii6}, the processing of data in the database, the security of the data in the database, the use of the database for purposes of cooperation with foreign entities and the monitoring of the functioning of the database. The database is an integrated information system that enables the processing and provision of data usage between the competent state authorities, as well as the exchange with foreign entities, with the aim of preventing and detecting criminal offenses in accordance with the law.

One of the recommendations in Priebe's^{xxiii} report that is important to mention and that affects the criminal-intelligence process is that communication tapping in order to conduct a forensic investigation and tapping for security reasons should be considered as separate functions and regulated separately. That is why in the following period, legal and institutional changes were implemented in the security sphere in the Republic of North Macedonia. First, on April 12, 2018, the Law on Interception of Communications^{xxiv} and the Law on Operational-Technical Agency^{xxv} were adopted by a two-thirds majority in the Parliament of the Republic of North Macedonia. The adoption of these laws is a milestone in the creation of a more responsible intelligence sector. Operational-Technical Agency (OTA) was established and started operating on November 1, 2018.

OTA serves as an intermediary in the process of monitoring communications between competent authorities and telecommunication operators. In addition, on May 22, 2019, the Law

on the National Security Agency^{xxvi} and the Law on Coordination of the Security Intelligence Community in the Republic of North Macedonia^{xxvii} were also adopted by a two-thirds majority. The National Security Agency (ANB) began operating on September 1, 2019. The new ANB director appointed by the government, said that ANB marks the end of a key phase of the country's security sector reform process. The ANB will focus on implementing reforms in line with European security standards, thereby contributing to the country's integration process in NATO and the EU as a factor of stability in the region. Then, the Civic Oversight Council, an independent oversight body designated and funded by Parliament, was set up in June 2019.

This whole new situation in the security-intelligence sphere in the country should contribute to proper, lawful and legal implementation of the envisaged legal powers, when it comes to gathering information and data (intelligence) for the needs of national security and defense of the state.

Conclusion

Terrorist organizations are very persistent and militant in pursuing their goals and visions, especially the desire to create their own state that fosters powerful morale and exaltation. They are prepared to withstand their utopian demands, although at times they may seem unreachable or unattainable. They are very cruel and effective, they leave nothing to chance and would do anything to realize their vision and all public threats. They will stop at nothing to substantiate their demands with violence driven by the burning desire to succeed at any cost, especially now in the modern 21st century. This is where the need to study this phenomenon arises, which can only be traced back to its essential existence through a multi-dimensional empirical and abstract logical analysis. Faced with a growing number of terrorist acts worldwide, it is logical to think of new strategic approaches to combating it. Utilizing modern tools and methods. One of such tools is criminal intelligence, which as a process enables the collection, processing and dissemination of timely, relevant and accurate data on future planned terrorist acts, in order to prevent them.

Gathering, analyzing and exchanging intelligence is one of the most important methods in the fight against international terrorism. The transnational nature of today's terrorism gives states a powerful impetus to exchange intelligence in order to prosecute terrorists and prevent future terrorist attacks. Gathering, analyzing and exchanging intelligence is one of the most important methods in the fight against international terrorism. The transnational nature of today's terrorism gives states a powerful impetus to exchange intelligence in order to prosecute

terrorists and prevent future terrorist attacks. However, exchanging anti-terrorist intelligence information is often difficult, especially when it comes to national security. There should be an exchange of anti-terrorist intelligence between the secret services of the states with a significant level of mutual trust. Unfortunately, however, distrust is part of the subculture of the secret services and other elements of the national security apparatus.

Strategic thinking in the fight against modern terrorism today is the basis for an effective police response. Without short-term and long-term predictions that will assume the direction of development of terrorist organizations, without thoughtful allocation of the already scarce resources it is not possible to successfully prevent, detect and process terrorist attacks. Certainly criminal intelligence and especially strategic analysis as part of it should be the basis of the new type of police service work. Modern terrorism is a complex type of crime that is preceded by a great deal of preparation and organization, and this is where strategic thinking should be directed. Obtaining data from all sources for processing and producing quantitative, temporal and demographic analyzes, descriptive and multivariate statistics, analytical mapping of terrorism and proper dissemination of information received should be the core work of the units in charge of proactive action in the fight against terrorism.

Multilateral information sharing, including indicators of potential attacks and alliances among cybercrime actors, are needed to deter cyber opponents. This requires the development of new analytical crafts, processes and policies. Intergovernmental instruments are needed to take full advantage of lateral information sharing, along with the development of distributed intelligence products, including the development of mechanisms for the exchange of information between the two nodes - intra-national and international.

Given the complex nature of extremism and terrorism, it can be concluded that enhanced collective action is necessary not only for the security services but also for all societal actors of political, legal, educational, social and religious aspect.

Firstly, it is the identification of all the factors that lead to radicalization and have terrorist potential, as well as their multidisciplinary and integrated treatment; then pursuing a policy of proactive preventive action, rather than repressive measures, by striking a balance between the effective protection against contemporary risks and dangers and protecting the already acquired freedoms and rights of citizens; thirdly, continual development and upgrading of the state's normative and institutional infrastructure, in line with the growing threats of terrorism and its modern forms of manifestation; implementation of complex educational, social and security measures and activities by all societal actors (state and non-governmental); specific

projects for de-radicalization of already radicalized individuals and rehabilitation, that is re-socialization of former terrorists.

ⁱ If those important events take place outside the country and are related to the intentions, goals, activities and behavior of other countries, then it can be said that providing information about these events is intelligence

ⁱⁱ Stamenkovski, A. (1999). *Basics of Intelligence*. Skopje: NIP Gjurgja, p. 17

ⁱⁱⁱ It automatically excludes things like gossip, insinuations and intuitions. Read more: Dimovski, Z. (2007). *Handbook, Criminal Intelligence*. Skopje: Grafotrans, p. 10

^{iv} Batkovski, T. (2008). Intelligence, security and counterintelligence tactic. Skopje Jofi -scan, p. 17

^v Retrieved from <http://www.dcaf.ch> – Basic data of DCAF Intelligence Services [Accessed: 10.03.2019]

^{vi} Geneva Centre for the democratic control of armed forces (DCAF), (2003). Occasional paper No. 3, *Intelligence practice and democratic oversight – a practitioner’s view*, Geneva: DCAF Intelligence Working Group, from <http://www.dcaf.ch> [Accessed: 15.03.2019]

^{vii} Budzakoski, S. (2005). *Intelligence*. Skopje, p. 31

^{viii} Dimovski, Z. (2007). *Handbook, Criminal Intelligence*. Skopje: Grafotrans, p. 12

^{ix} There is a strict separation of criminal intelligence process and investigative process, that is, the competence of the organizational units in charge of investigating crimes and processing them before courts, which are essentially complementary.

^x Read more: Bockstette, C. (2008). *Jihadist Terrorist Use of Strategic Communication Management Techniques*, George C. Marshall European Center for Security Studies, Number 20

^{xi} Terrorists attack by studying and learning from previous terrorist campaigns. According to: Hoff-man, B. (2006). *Inside Terrorism* (Revised and Expanded Edition), New York: Columbia University Press

^{xii} Advances in information technology can facilitate this transformation. The Internet and teleconferencing technology enable information communities to gather and exchange information in a virtual way, yet in real time.

^{xiii} Dimovski, Z., Ilijevski, I., Babanoski, K. (2011). Intelligence as a key link in the fight against terrorism, *International scientific conference Security in the post conflict (Western) Balkans: Transition and challenges faced by the Republic of Macedonia (Security Studies and the Science of Security)*, Skopje: Faculty of security, pp. 268-281

^{xiv} Kotovcevski, M. (2004). *Fighting Terrorism*, Skopje: Macedonian Civilization, Skopje, p. 176

^{xv} Dojcinovski, M., Odzakov, F. (2010). *Intelligence Operations*, Solaris Print, Skopje, 2010, p. 178

^{xvi} Read more: Kotovcevski, M., *Intelligence Golden Key in the Fight against Terrorism, Intelligence Shield in Defense against Terrorism*, Retrieved from :

<http://def.fzf.ukim.edu.mk/pdf/odb/kotovcevski/Kotovcevski.%20M.%20-%20Razuznavanjeto%20zlaten%20kluc%20vo%20borbata%20protiv%20terorizmot.pdf> [Accessed: 05.03.2019]

^{xvii} National Concept for Security and Defense, Parliament of the Republic of Macedonia, 11.06.2003, <http://morm.gov.mk/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/Nacionalna-koncepcija-za-bezbednost-i-odbrana.pdf>

^{xviii} National Strategy Against Terrorism (2018-2022), Skopje, February 2018, https://vlada.mk/sites/default/files/dokumenti/bpt_nacionalna_strategija_2018.pdf

^{xix} National Strategy for the Prevention of Violent Extremism (2018-2022), Skopje, February 2018, https://vlada.mk/sites/default/files/dokumenti/sne_nacionalna_strategija_2018.pdf

^{xx} the interviews were unstructured, conducted on 03.03.2020

^{xxi} Law on Police, Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia no. 114/06, 6/09, 145/12, 41/14, 33/15, 31/16, 106/16, 120/16, 21/18, 64/18, Decision of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Macedonia, 148/08 - unofficial consolidated text

^{xxii} Law on National Criminal Intelligence Database, Official Gazette of RM no. 120/09

^{xxiii} Recommendations of the Senior Experts’ Group on systemic Rule of Law issues relating to the communications interception revealed in Spring 2015, https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/sites/near/files/news_corner/news/newsfiles/20150619_recommendations_of_the_senior_experts_group.pdf [accessed on 02.03.2020]

^{xxiv} Law on Interception of Communications, Official Gazette of RM no. 71/18, 108/19

^{xxv} Law on Operational-Technical Agency, Official Gazette of RM no. 71/18

^{xxvi} Law on National Security Agency, Official Gazette of the Republic of North Macedonia. No. 108/19

^{xxvii} Law on Coordination of the Security Intelligence Community in the Republic of North Macedonia, Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia. no. 108/19

References

- Batkovski, T. (2008) *Intelligence, security and counterintelligence tactics*. Skopje: Jofi-scan (In Macedonian)
- Best, R., A. (2003) *Intelligence to Counter Terrorism: Issues for Congress*, Congressional Research Service, The Library of Congress, Retrieved from <http://www.au.af.mil/au/awc/awcgate/crs/rl31292.pdf> [Accessed: 15.03.2019]
- Bockstette, C. (2008) *Jihadist Terrorist Use of Strategic Communication Management Techniques*, George C. Marshall European Center for Security Studies, Number 20
- Bruneau, T., C. (2008) Democracy and Effectiveness: Adapting Intelligence for the Fight Against Terrorism, *International Journal of Intelligence and CounterIntelligence*, Taylor & Francis Group, LLC, 21:3, p. 448–460, Retrieved from: www.ccmr.org/public/library_file_proxy.cfm/lid/5585 [Accessed: 15.03.2019]
- Budzakoski, S. (2005) *Intelligence*. Ohrid: Kosta Abrash a.d. (In Macedonian)
- Dimovski, Z., Ilijevski, I., Babanoski, K. (2011). Intelligence as a key link in the fight against terrorism, *International scientific conference Security in the post conflict (Western) Balkans: Transition and challenges faced by the Republic of Macedonia (Security Studies and the Science of Security)*, Skopje: Faculty of security, pp. 268-281
- Dimovski, Z., Ilijevski, I. (2011) *International Terrorism*, Skopje: Faculty of Security. (In Macedonian)
- Dimovski, Z. (2007) *Terrorism*, Skopje: Grafotrans (In Macedonian)
- Gelke, A. (2009) *The New Era of Terrorism and the International Political System*, Skopje: Magor (In Macedonian)
- Geneva Centre for the democratic control of armed forces (DCAF) (2003) Occasional paper No. 3, *Intelligence practice and democratic oversight – a practitioner’s view*, Geneva: DCAF Intelligence Working Group, преземено од <http://www.dcaf.ch> [Accessed: 15.03.2019]
- Gray, D., Slade, C. (2008). Applying the Intelligence Cycle Model to Counterterrorism Intelligence for Homeland Security, *European Journal of Scientific Research*, Vol. 24 No. 4, EuroJournals Publishing, Inc., p. 498-519, Retrieved from http://www.eurojournals.com/ejsr_24_4_06.pdf [Accessed: 10.03.2019]
- Hoffman, B. (2006). *Inside Terrorism* (Revised and Expanded Edition), New York: Columbia University Press
- Quiggin, T. (2009). *Seeing The Invisible: National Security Intelligence In In Uncertain Age*, Skopje: Magor (In Macedonian)

Kotovcevski, M. (2003). *Contemporary Terrorism*, Skopje: Macedonian Civilization (In Macedonian)

Kotovcevski, M. (2004). *Fighting Terrorism*, Skopje: Macedonian Civilization (In Macedonian)

Kotovcevski, M., Intelligence Golden Key in the Fight against Terrorism, Intelligence Shield in Defense against Terrorism, Retrieved from :

<http://def.fzf.ukim.edu.mk/pdf/odb/kotovcevski/Kotovcevski,%20M.%20-%20Razuznavanjeto%20zlaten%20kluc%20vo%20borbata%20protiv%20terorizmot.pdf>

[Accessed: 05.03.2019]

Cronin, K., O., Loudes, M., J. (2009). *Attacking Terrorism: Elements of a Grand Strategy*, Skopje: Nampress (In Macedonian)

Malis-Sazdovska, M. (2005). *Intelligence Cycle Handbook*, Skopje: Jofi-scan (In Macedonian)

Odzakov, F. (2010). *The Role of the Intelligence Services in the Fight Against Terrorism and Organized Crime*, Skopje: Solaris Print (In Macedonian)

Stamenkovski, A. (1999). *Basics of Intelligence*. Skopje: NIP Gjurgja (In Macedonian)

Steinberg, J., Graham, M., Eggers, A. (2003). *Building Intelligence to Fight Terrorism*, The Brookings Institution, Policy Brief #125, Washington, Retrieved from:

http://www.brookings.edu/~media/Files/rc/papers/2003/09intelligence_steinberg/pb125.pdf

[Accessed: 10.03.2019]

Sullivan, J., P. (2005). Terrorism Early Warning and Co-Production of Counterterrorism Intelligence, *Canadian Association for Security and Intelligence Studies CASIS 20th Anniversary International Conference*, Montreal, Quebec, Canada, Retrieved from:

http://www.projectwhitehorse.com/pdfs/6.%20CASIS_Sullivan_paper1.pdf

[Accessed:05.03.2019]

Official documents

National Concept for Security and Defense, Parliament of the Republic of Macedonia, 11.06.2003, <http://morm.gov.mk/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/Nacionalna-koncepcija-za-bezbednost-i-odbrana.pdf>

National Strategy Against Terrorism (2018-2022), Skopje, February 2018, https://vlada.mk/sites/default/files/dokumenti/bpt_nacionalna_strategija_2018.pdf

National Strategy for the Prevention of Violent Extremism (2018-2022), Skopje, February 2018, https://vlada.mk/sites/default/files/dokumenti/sne_nacionalna_strategija_2018.pdf

Law on National Security Agency, Official Gazette of the Republic of North Macedonia. No. 108/19

Law on Coordination of the Security Intelligence Community in the Republic of North Macedonia, Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia. no. 108/19

Law on National Criminal Intelligence Database, Official Gazette of RM no. 120/09

Law on Operational-Technical Agency, Official Gazette of RM no. 71/18

Law on Police, Official Gazette of the Republic of Macedonia no. 114/06, 6/09, 145/12, 41/14, 33/15, 31/16, 106/16, 120/16, 21/18, 64/18, Decision of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Macedonia, 148/08 - unofficial consolidated text

Law on Interception of Communications, Official Gazette of RM no. 71/18, 108/19

Recommendations of the Senior Experts' Group on systemic Rule of Law issues relating to the communications interception revealed in Spring 2015, https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/sites/near/files/news_corner/news/newsfiles/20150619_recommendations_of_the_senior_experts_group.pdf [пристапено на 02.03.2020]